PHOTOGRAPHIC REPRESENTATION OF WOMEN IN THE MEDIA. A CASE STUDY OF THE POST.

DESENIO SOOBBEN
DURBAN UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY, SOUTH AFRICA.

ABSTRACT
The under-representation of women in the media has been contested by gender activists the world over. Studies have indicated that women are more likely to be portrayed on advertising bill-boards than as serious news sources. Therein lies the problem. Saturated by the media, visual representation becomes a means of how to make sense of the world. If women are continually portrayed in a narrow range of roles and particularly as second-class citizens, does that not shape one’s understanding of the world? More importantly, how do the women rise above that status? Being a photographer, of Indian descent, the subject was of particular interest to the researcher. This paper examines the theories underpinning representation, in particular, identity, gender and the selection and production of photographs.

Based on the above data, the Post, a national newspaper targeted at the South African Indian population, was selected as a case study. A select population of the staff at Post was interviewed. The empirical research specifically examines the selection and production of photographs in the Post. Based on the literature and empirical data, the study maintains that there are many challenges facing the media, specifically relating to the visual representation of women. Based on the findings, the paper offers recommendations that may assist in improving techniques in the photographic process of composing, selecting and producing photographs in the Post.

1. Introduction - The Problem and its setting.
This study focuses on the photographic representation of women in the Post. It, therefore, sets out to observe the factors that are considered during the various stages of the photographic process. In brief, this study sets out to explore how women are represented in the print media, in particular the Post. In order to solve this research problem, the following objectives were set: (i) To review and critique the literature that informs current theories of representation and media selection and production; and (ii) To conduct empirical research with staff at the Post. The emphasis, however, is on the photographic processes and techniques used when photographing women. Empirical research within Post will reveal the factors that are considered during the various photographic processes, namely: Composition; Selection; and Production.

For many decades, women have appeared in a narrow range of roles and were often portrayed in the media as second class citizens. According to McQuail (2002: 101), media messages were seen as “stereotyped and carrying a predominantly patriarchal and conservative ideology or pandered to male sexuality”. The images generated by the media give one the impression that women are more valued for their ‘down-to-earth’ approach, other than viewed as an appendage to the male counterpart in the story. The researcher is concerned with the manner in which women are portrayed through photographs in the print media. Photography is merely an instrument of representation. By examining the “representational paradigm in more detail we can focus more closely on the condition of photographic production, the social context in which the work was created” (Hamilton, 1997:79).

Of particular interest to this study is the Post, a weekly national newspaper targeted at a predominantly Indian audience. Photographs published on the front page of selected editions of the Post will be the primary area of research. The process and production of images as well as editing and lay-out will be analysed through interviews with reporters, photographers and sub-editors. The study will attempt to investigate if women are perceived as decorative add-ons or serious and valued role-players in society. The study, therefore, demonstrates that gender stereotypes are often embedded in all types of visual images, particularly in photographs, on billboards, and television (Seidman, 2002:94). As a result, gender images and identity are created by the media. The study will attempt to look at how the Post constructs gender images and identity.

The image of women can change by the way a page is designed. There are various processes that can severely censor an image, such as cropping, enlarging and highlighting often play an important part in the way the readers interpret or make sense of it. The photographic process of composition, including the use of lighting, varied apertures, filters, different lenses and editing, for example, cropping, enlarging, highlighting and darkening will be analysed. These processes change the meaning of photographs. Hamilton (1997:86) refers to the photographic process as a “double process of construction”. The first part of the construction is the composition, selection and framing of the images. What follows in the second process is textual information, in other words, reports and captions accompanying the photographs. Media practitioners draw upon their own experiences and ideas regarding male and female persons, particularly “about gender roles and behaviour; about how women and men act and think; and also our beliefs about people’s physical appearance, even their body shapes” (Seidman, 2002:94).

Creative director and executive director of The Star, Dave Hazelhurst, stresses the importance of women in positions of decision making, without which, he argues “there can be no real change, and, consequently, design can only have negative gender implications” (2002:110). According to Hazelhurst (2002:110), “nothing sets the tone of paper more than pictures” and “everyone is involved – news editors, reporters, copy-tasters, editors, layout-sub, picture editors and copy-subs”. Therefore, editors and sub-editors have a choice in the portrayal of women. It appears that women portrayed in the front pages of the Post seem conservative in demeanour, frequently perceived as an appendage to their husbands, almost as an add-on and not a ‘stand alone’. I believe the Post could do well to address these injustices. It is within this context that this paper sets out to examine the representation of women in the print media.

The initial stage of the photographic process is the composition of a photograph. The photographer demonstrates the factors that are considered during the composition of a photograph. The second stage of the photographic process is the selection of the photograph. The sub-editor is tasked with this process. The sub-editor will illustrate what factors are considered when selecting a photograph. The final stage of the photographic process is the production of the photograph. The result is the production of the image on the printed page. Based on the findings from the literature review and the empirical investigation, the paper offers recommendations.

2. Media Selection and production of photographs in the Post.
The act of representation is an ancient practice. It has always been part of mankind’s social practice, from sophisticated cave paintings and carvings to intricate jewellery. Whilst representation was previously restricted to art galleries and places of worship, the physical and technical production of representations was revolutionized in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century. It was the photographic camera that led to this transformation. Visual representations are now on display on buses, buildings, bill boards, and lamp-posts and in shopping malls (Reid, 2008: 206). In fact, for most people in the western and developing world, life is saturated with visual images and representations. It is, after all, how we communicate with one another and, more importantly, make sense of the world. Williams (2003: 121) maintains that audiences have learnt to actively filter such masses of representations on a constant basis in order to try to receive only those meanings which were important to them. If this is the case, are women, in general, aware of how they are represented in the media? The researcher finds it necessary to explore ways in which the South African media report and re-present the social world in order to examine the impact of the media on their audiences. The case study is the Post, a national weekly newspaper. In the past, the media in
South Africa was under tremendous strain as society was polarized and unequal. The South African media had to contend with social, political and economical conditions in a country with disparaging proportions. Understandably, the subject of gender representations did not seem to be a priority in the media and women of colour were particularly at a disadvantage. However, since democratization, gender representation in the South African media has received considerable attention.

2.1 The origins of the Post
The Post has been in operation since 1960. Launched as *Golden City POST* by Sir Jim Bailey in 1955, it set off at a time when the apartheid ideology was just beginning to tighten its grip on society (Howard, 2005: 3). The Post highlighted the political struggle and made mockery of laws like the Immorality Act, the Mixed Marriages Act and the Group Areas Act. It also highlighted bannings, house arrests and imprisonment of political leaders, the battle to get South Africa expelled from world sport, and the birth of the Black Consciousness Movement. It led to the change of the Post’s slogan from “paper for the people” to the “voice and heart of the community”. In fact, the Post is the biggest-selling weekly newspaper serving the Indian Diaspora in South Africa. It expresses the views, fears, threats and aspirations of the Indian community. The Consul General of India, emphasizes the role of the Post as it also helps sustain the historical linkages between India and South Africa. In doing so, the newspaper has helped the local Indian community in preserving and maintaining its cultural heritage and traditions. According to Swarup, the Post has been a forerunner in the struggle against colonialism, imperialism, inequality and racial discrimination. It has helped the community in preserving and maintaining its cultural heritage and traditions (Swarup, 2005: 5).

However, the democratic era of the 1990s soon changed the perceptions that Indians were a homogeneous group. There was a “resurgence of ethnic and sub-ethnic identities (class, language, religion, geographic origins)” (Maharaj, 2007: 19). Today, while the older generation upholds the values and traditions of their fore-fathers, the younger generation is quite often modern and westernized, in thinking and in dress. Herein lies the dichotomy. The Post upholds the values and traditions of the Indian culture, however, does it have a fixed notion of what an Indian woman ought to be like? Meanings, consequently, will always change, from one culture or period to another” (Hall, 1997: 61). Has the Post adjusted its stance and forged ahead with the modern times, or has it lagged behind? The main thrust of the argument is, how are women represented through photographs in the Post? Is the Post bound to the traditional and cultural views of the past? Of significance are the photographic images of women in the Post. Visual signs and images carry meaning and, therefore, have to be interpreted (Hall, 1997: 21). After all, meaning is produced through representation. However, photographs are nearly always constructed within a social context. Of particular interest to the research, is to ascertain how women are photographed and portrayed in the Post. The researcher aims to examine the process of photographic production and the social context by which it was created (Hamilton, 1997: 79). Posed questions, will give the researcher an indication of how the Post production team, made up of reporters, photographers and sub-editors, select, process and produce photographic images.

2.2 Media Selection and Production
The term “gatekeeping” has been widely used to describe the method by which selections are made in media work. For the most part, gatekeepers decide what is going to appear and how it is going to appear in the media. Gate-keeping also applies to the different kinds of editorial and production work in print and television. It refers to the power to grant or deny access to different voices in society and is often an area of conflict (McQuail, 2002: 276). McQuail (2002: 276) argues that the weakness in the concept of gatekeeping is that there is generally one main set of selection criteria and its tendency to individualize decision-making. Len-Rios et al. (2005: 155) suggest that under-representation of women is intricately connected to news production. Apart from selection and emphasis or placement, gatekeepers can also insert and delete material into existing news reports. According to Oosthuizen (2001: 198), ideally, editors ought to perform their tasks in accordance with the broad guidelines laid down by their board of directors. However, if they do not keep to these guidelines, it can lead to conflict. It is, therefore, obvious that editors can act as strict gatekeepers and that they can discard or ignore stories or news items that do not conform to their own beliefs or policies. In this way, news and photographs can be distorted.

Williams (2003: 153) maintains that people with political and economic power use ideology to maintain their privileged positions. Similarly, media owners shape the messages that the media produce. Thus the hegemonic hierarchy remains. It follows then that as Williams (2003: 155) notes, Barthes argued that the media, through their ability to makes images and signs work, disseminate and ideological view of the world. “Between the very broad, general conditions and power relations in the world and the ideological messages which shape media texts that are delivered to audiences is an important system of production” (Carter and Steinder, 2004: 15). The question to ask is how media discourses contribute or challenge the “structural (re) production of gender inequalities” (Carter and Steiner, 2004: 14).

Some of the questions to ask would be: Which audiences are being served? Are women and men addressed differently, via texts with different varieties of intellectual and emotional content? If newspapers under-represent women, they then add to the public approval of male cultural hegemony. Women, therefore, are excluded from a significant symbol of power (Len-Rios et al., 2005: 152). Furthermore, the media constructs, presents and even dictates what ‘reality’ is, as well as what is ‘normal’ and ‘natural’ (Karam, 2008: 317). Dominant groups use the media to reinforce their definition of normality and reality. The underlying question, therefore, is how are women represented visually? The management at The Star saw the need to change their policies for several reasons. One of the most important reasons was the large number of competent women in positions of power (Hazelhurst, 2002: 110). Hazelhurst came to the conclusion that there can be no real change without women in decision-making jobs. Consequently, design can only have negative gender implications. The employment and promotion policies must legitimately empower women. For many years, women have experienced the newsroom as a hostile environment, particularly because they have been patronized and marginalized. Even though working conditions for women have advanced considerably, it seems as though women have reached the ‘glass ceiling’.

Today, photographers use new methods of representing subject matter. The camera was always considered to be like a ‘mirror held up to Nature’ (Hamilton, 1997: 79). However, we can focus more closely on the condition of photographic production. For instance, through the use of colour filters, framing or highlighting a photograph does not necessarily reflect the subject matter in its entirety. The photograph is not longer the ‘true image’ of the world (Hamilton, 1997: 79). Fiske (1990: 16) maintains that photographs are open to a number of readings, in other words, they are polysemic. The photographer, through his or her personal interpretations, chooses which events or subjects to place in front of the camera. Hamilton (1997: 85) maintains that often a “double process of construction at work”. First, the photographer constructs and frames the image. Thereafter, there is a second process of construction, where photographs are selected out from their original ordering and placed within the confines of a caption. Barthes uses the term anchorage to describe the function of words used as captions for photographs. Visual images, he argues, are polysemic: ‘they imply, underlying their signifiers, a floating chain of signifieds, and the reader able to choose some and ignore others’. However, Williams (2003: 153) makes mention of Hall’s input and how influential it was in shaping research into the reception and production of media messages. According to Williams (2003: 153), Hall argued that the media and their audiences play a part in the process of producing ideological meaning. It also introduced the concept of the media being a “site of struggle over the production of meaning”.

324
Representation of photographic images influences gender identity. Therefore, the selection and production of photographs have an impact on the portrayal of women and, accordingly influence the identity of women. The triangular relationships among texts, media organizations and industries, and audiences’ practices were examined. Of significance, was an overview of the Post; Women in the Media; and finally, the Selection and Production of Photographs. Having discussed the triangular relationships among texts and images, the Post and its readers, the researcher proceeds to look at the methodology used to conduct the empirical study.

3. Research Methodology
This study has made use of open-ended questions in the interview schedules as methods that were used to collect data in a qualitative study. It is for this reason that the method of qualitative research was used. Personal interviews were used. This study was limited to interviews of the staff of Post. Audience analyses were not conducted. Only a sample of a population is selected for any given study in qualitative research. The staff of Post comprises ten staff members, an editor, two sub-editors, five reporters and one administrator. This study, therefore, identified the sub-editor, photographer and two women reporters of the Post in order to obtain valid findings. These personnel were representative of the Post staff. Although there was much discussion around the readers, the study did not explore audience analysis. It was limited to the selected personnel at Post and not its readers. Therefore, for this study, primary data were collected through an empirical study using a standardised interview and secondary data were collected by conducting a review of related literature. The interview schedule comprised open-ended and semi-structured questions. Follow-up questions were useful to clarify the response from the interviewees. The triangulation method of collecting data was used. Triangulation data are drawn from different sources (Flick, 2004: 178). It usually refers to combining multiple theories, observers, methods, and empirical materials to produce a more accurate, objective and comprehensive representation of the aim of study (Silverman, 2006: 291).

The researcher was given access to archives of the Post, three editions were chosen and the articles and photographs are attached (Annexures A and B). The researcher was also handed a 2008 Research Survey which included the AMPs and readership profile demographics. In addition, the researcher photocopied a thirty-two page supplement celebrating Post’s 50 years in circulation. This supplement proved to be an invaluable source as it contained the rich history of the Post. This study, therefore, used the triangulation method of collecting data as it was considered to be the most appropriate. As the interviews were conducted, the answers were recorded manually by the researcher. In addition, interviews were audio recorded. The interviews were then transcribed by the researcher. Thereafter, the data were prepared for analysis. The interviews were coded according to the various themes that were identified in the literature review sted. The researcher read through the interviews and identified the issues that were set out to be explored in the research. Unexpected generalizations in the course of data analysis lead one to seek out new deviant (unusual – unexpected) cases (Silverman, 2006: 303) and go against the pattern identified. Silverman suggests that researchers ought to overcome any tendency to select a case which is likely to support their argument.

4. Findings and Analysis
A thematic analysis of the data obtained from the empirical study follows. It further provides a discussion of these findings and sets the platform for the analysis and recommendations of the study. The research methodology confines the empirical research to interviews of those who produce the paper i.e. the photographers; sub-editor and reporter. The findings are, therefore, reported according to these interviews.

4.1 Composition plays an integral role in the photographic process.
Images are often manipulated through ‘cut and paste’, cropping, highlighting, darkening and lightening. What factors are considered during photographic processes? The findings revealed that it is evident that in composing a photograph, the photographer’s key consideration during photographing a woman revolves around the physical beauty of the subject. Literature states that the photographer’s influence – framing, focus, lighting and camera angle, - produces a subjective element in the final sign. However, based on the above response, it seems as though the sub-editor makes use of these various techniques to enhance the photograph and not necessarily to change its meaning.

Evidence suggests that the Post photographer has to work within certain boundaries. According to the findings, the photographer “cannot show any ‘flesh’ and, secondly, “the woman must be appealing but not ‘sexy’ appealing”. These remarks stem from management’s view of the Post. According to the editor; the Post changed its “racy, sexy Golden City Post (Natal) image” to become far more family oriented (Ramguthie, 2005: 1). In addition, one of the main strategies of Post’s management was to eliminate the image Post had acquired, that of publishing pictures of attractive young women on page three. Therefore, the above evidence suggests that the Post photographer has certain limitations and restrictions that he has to adhere to. Literature of Hall (1993: 98) maintains that the sphere of preferred readings have the “whole social order embedded in them as a set of meanings, practices and beliefs: the everyday knowledge of social structures, of ‘how things work for all practical purposes in this culture’, the rank order of power and interest”. Based on literature by Ramguthie (2005: 1), it seems apparent that Post’s management has taken a stance on its views on women, therefore implying that society follows its example. Fiske (1990: 112) elaborates on Hall’s theory, stating that the dominant system is the preferred readings of society as it is one that conveys the dominant values.

4.1.2 The Selection of photographs is predominantly (if not only) done by the males.
Based on the findings regarding the selection of photographs, it is evident that there is a bias towards the opinions of the males in the newsroom, in this instance the photographer, sub-editor and editor. It is also evident that in the selection and production of photographs (also known as gate-keeping), there is much contestation. The tendency is also to individualize decision making. Literature (Len-Rios et al., 2005: 155) suggests that the under-representation of women is connected to news production. Based on the findings, the photographer’s view that a photograph will be used depending on the “editor’s frame of mind at that time” is evident that a photograph or story has to conform to the editor’s own beliefs, otherwise it is not used. Seidman (2002: 94) maintains that media practitioners draw upon their own experiences and notions about male and female persons about many factors, for instance, gender roles, behaviour, how women and men think and act, and our beliefs about body shapes. It is, therefore, important for women to be in positions of making decisions. Hazellhurst (2002: 110) argues that without women at the helm of the news media, there can be very little change.

Based on the above response, it is, therefore, evident that the sub-editor has many factors to take into account when selecting a photograph. This does vary on a weekly basis. However, a closer look at the role of the sub-editor at the Post indicates that he merely has a job to do. The main task is to make the paper look attractive, thereby encouraging sales. McQuail (2002: 265) supports this view by adding that “media organizations are to a great extent in the business of producing spectaculars as a way of creating audiences and generating profit.
and employment”. McQuail adds that there is “an assumption that the personal characteristics of those most directly responsible for media production will influence content” (2002: 265). This assumption does seem to be the case at the Post.

4.1.3 Women have been misrepresented in the media

The representation of women in the media has always been a point of contestation. Based on the comments of the chief photographer: “we’re looking for sex, even if it means a pretty face that goes on the front page”, it is evident that Post perceives a women as commodities. In other words, without the “pretty face”, the product, which is the newspaper, will not sell. The sub-editor states that for the past eight years there has always been a picture of a woman on the front page ‘be it glamour or murder’. Based on the findings, it seems evident that women are perceived as either ‘victims’ or decorative add-ons and not as serious role-players in society. Literature by Seidman (2002: 94) supports this view as she maintains that ‘gender stereotypes are heavily embedded in all forms of visual images’. The visual image has a powerful effect on how one views the world. In addition, according to the sub-editor, photographs of beauty pageants bring out the ‘brightness of the paper’ and these images are used to attract more male readers. Media texts do not merely mirror or reflect ‘reality’, but instead construct hegemonic meaning of what should be accepted as ‘reality’. These meanings appear to be ‘real’, inevitable and full of common sense. Not surprisingly though, feminists have drawn on the concept of hegemony in order to argue that most of us cannot see how patriarchal ideology is made to appear as ‘objective’, non-gendered and neutral and non-ideological.

With this in mind, it seems as though staff members at Post are responsible for what is produced in the paper and readers accept it as the ‘norm’ and as a mirror of ‘reality’. A key point to remember is that hegemonic realities must be constantly reconstructed, contested, renegotiated and renaturalized (Carter and Steinder, 2004: 2). Literature by Fiske (1990: 16) implies that photographs are open to a number of readings, in other words, they are polysemic. They are never as easy to decode as they may appear. On a technical level, the context makes the picture easier to decode, especially at a quick, first glance. Literature, by Carter and Steinder (2004: 14), suggests that sexist stereotypes encourage people to believe that women are suited to ‘traditional’ female sex roles. The findings reveal that ‘blood and guts sell’ and “it’s mainly the women who are victims”. These views are supported by the literature of Morna et al. (2002: 96). According to research within the media in Southern African (Morna et al., 2002: 96), more women are shown as victims, receivers and helpless sufferers rather than women who are “makers and shakers”. These stereotypes, therefore, discourage people from accepting women who are independent, strong and self-confident. It also habituates women’s ability to realize their full professional and personal potential. The fundamental problem, therefore, lies in the representation of women.

4.1.4 Deviant Case

Unexpected generalizations in the course of data analysis lead one to seek out new deviant cases. Based on the findings, it is evident that photographers do face certain challenges. Whilst it was an important provincial rugby game, the sports editor still had to ‘smuggle’ the photograph because it went against the ethos of the newspaper. The Post aspires to be family orientated and far more acceptable to all members of a household than the Golden City Post. However, had this photograph been taken whilst the Golden City Post was in circulation, it would not have been a problem. The “racy, sexy Golden City Post (Natal)” changed its body shape and face” as the “strategy was to eliminate the image POST had acquired, that is, publishing pictures of attractive young women on page three” (Ramguthue, 2005: 1).

It is evident that deviant cases do create a ‘stir’ in the newsroom. In the literature by Silverman (2006: 309), he notes that deviant cases go against the pattern identified. These negative instances offer a crucial test to the theory. The case study of the Sharks Flasher Model (Annexure B) seems to have surprised many staff. Interestingly, the respondent mentions that the model had a flag around her, suggesting that the flag was ‘wrapped’ around her, thereby ‘lessening’ the impact of her bikini-clad body. However, upon examination of the photograph, it appears that the flag was used as a backdrop as it was positioned behind her. The findings indicate that the editor is conservative and of ‘the old school’. However, the deviant case, identified above, seems to prove otherwise and go against the grain. The Post ought to take responsibility for representing women in a way that will help to break the shackles of patriarchy. Sexist stereotypes encourage people to believe that women are suited “only (and always) to so-called ‘traditional’ female sex roles and discourage people from accepting women who are strong, assertive, independent and self-confident, thus inhibiting women’s ability to realize their full personal and professional potential (Carter and Steiner, 2004: 14). Therefore, the fundamental problem lies in the misrepresentation of women. “What does it mean to live as a woman? To what extent does gender – our own identities as male and female, our ideas about what that might mean – shape our experience of the culture around us?” (Parry and Karam, 2001:383).

5. Conclusions and Recommendations

The conclusions and recommendations are based on the literature review and the empirical study. The conclusions and recommendations are presented on the key themes identified in the literature review and used in the research instrument.

- Photographs in the Post present a one dimensional stereotype. It is, therefore, recommended that photographers consider improving techniques in the photographic process of composing, selecting and producing photographs in the Post.
- The selection of photographs was done predominately by men. It is, therefore, recommended that women reporters and junior reporters participate in the selection of photographs. This process would thereby ensure that photographs are more reflective of a changing society.
- Photographs of women on the front cover of Post reflect ‘beauty or blood’. It is, therefore, recommended that the staff find alternative photographs depicting the modern Indian woman.
- It is recommended that photographers and staff at Post consider attending a gender course hosted by Genderlinks, a gender based organization that trains media workers on issues of gender and gender sensitivity

Based on the above conclusions, the study therefore recommends that staff at the Post pay particular attention to the portrayal of women as many Indian women are modern, out-going career women. Audience surveys ought to be conducted to gauge how the Indian woman would like to be portrayed on the front page of the Post. During the selection of photographs, the process should include women and junior reporters. When women are at the helm of decision making, a positive gender dispensation increases. The policy of selection and production of photographs at the POST should be reviewed to become a wider process to include more reporters. The policy should consider the younger career orientated readers. Finally, photographs published in the Post ought to reflect today’s modern women. This study was only limited to photographs in the Post. The study recommends an in-depth look into audience analysis research of the Post. In addition, the researcher recommends that a study be conducted into representation of women in the mass media.

References


ICCMTD

09-11 May 2012

Istanbul - Turkey
Swanup, A. (2005). India’s best to you. POST Supplement: Celebrating 50 Years! March 16-20: 5

Annexure

Ms India 2008 Hopefuls. The model with the sultry look
POST 16 October 2008

A
Sharks look to a hard bite

Yosheen Govender – the “Sharks Flasher Girl” –
POST 3 October 2008